

This document contains materials for a role-play debate taught by Dr. Shin Ji Kang from James Madison University in ELED 310 Diversity in Elementary Education during the Spring 2020 semester:

Annotated Bibliography checklist

Debate and Rebuttal tips

Opening speech outline guideline

Opening speech evaluation form

Team debate activity evaluation checklist

Team debate guide

Team debate peer evaluation form

Annotated Bibliographies Evaluation Checklist (possible points = 9)

Name _____; Group and role _____

Areas	Points	Comments
<p>Sources (3 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><input type="checkbox"/> All of the bibliographic citations have direct relevance to the topic and particular roles (debater or decision maker).<input type="checkbox"/> All sources are from scholarly and scientific research recently published.		
<p>Annotations (4 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><input type="checkbox"/> Key information and significant insights are clearly and		

<p>thoroughly identified for all sources.</p>		
<p>Formats (2 point)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><input type="checkbox"/> All bibliographic citations meet the APA requirement.<input type="checkbox"/> Not technical errors are identified.<input type="checkbox"/> Multiple sources and sections and professionally and neatly organized. <p>*Point deductions can be made if the assignment instructions are not followed properly.</p>		

Debate and Rebuttal Tips:

Know your team's case inside out. If the debate is prepared, you should be reading and rereading your teammates' speeches and improving them as a team. Brainstorm as much as you can. Be prepared and practice your speech. Never let anybody write your speeches for you. This will prevent you from knowing what you're talking about; let alone what the rest of your team is talking about. Work with your teammates to have the strongest argument.

Plug holes in your speech before they are exploited. If you can see an opportunity where your opponent will attempt to rebut, they will see it too. For example, if you are advocating Policy A over Policy B, and you say Policy A is more costly, make sure you add a disclaimer, such as "Even though Policy A costs more, the superior quality is well worth the cost". This way, your opponents may not even try to rebut that point at all, and if they do, you've set the basis for an easy rebuttal.

Get into the mindset of your opponents. Sometimes it can be useful to pretend you have been allocated to the other side of the debate, and try to get into the opponents' minds. Does policy B have better return rates? A lower cost? Write down as many of these rebuttals as possible, and how you plan to counter them. If you can walk into a debate with a few semi-prepared rebuttals, it makes your job so much easier.

Know your opponent's case! The first speaker of the opposing team will outline the arguments their entire team will make. Write these down quickly, and then pay keen attention to the rest of their speech. You must take in as much information from them as is possible.

Find something that's wrong with their argument. Do they contradict themselves? Are they cherry-picking arguments? Can you counter a hypothesis of theirs with facts? An opponent's argument is NEVER airtight. Write down anything and everything that you could use for a rebuttal.

Prepare a rebuttal palm card. A useful format is to write down an opponent's argument. Then you can use a paraphrased form of what they said, and a dot-point that you will use to rebut. Order your palm cards by importance.

Relax, and pretend you're elsewhere. Try thinking you are having a conversation with an argumentative friend, or better yet, a teacher. Be polite, and be formal, but above all, relax. This will make it a lot easier to recite your argument and be confident.

Speak off the top of your head. Once you've exhausted whatever is written on your palm card, you treat the rebuttal as you would an ordinary conversation. When you talk to your friends, you don't think about what you're saying beforehand, do you? It just comes out. Try to position your mind so that you are having a conversation, and it will become much easier to give impromptu rebuttals.

Be confident. In a debate, nothing is worse than a person who clearly thinks the other team is smarter, better or winning. You're winning, and you just proved it with your rebuttal. Be proud of what you have achieved.

Use analogies. Get used to using analogies or hypothetical situations. They are a fantastic tool to have in your arsenal, not only because they are effective, but also because they take up more time than a one-liner will. Use them sparingly, however.

Use research to back your argument or rebuttal up. Don't forget about 'technical' rebuttals. If you and the other team disagree on the definition of the topic, make sure you continue to address why your definition is correct and theirs isn't. If they forget to address it, this can win you easy points. Know not only useful facts, but also their origin. You can often use these to completely contradict an opponent's argument. There is nothing more humorous than putting an opposing team in their place with accurate facts that is backed up from credible sources. Attack the opposing team's arguments, not the opposing team themselves.

Never, ever, admit you were wrong. If you don't have a counterattack for their rebuttal, don't address it at all.

Debate Opening Speech Outline Guideline

I. Introduction

- A. Use attention-getting device to gain the interest of your audience and introduce the topic of your presentation.
- B. Establish the significance, relevance and importance of your presentation topic.
- C. Clearly communicate your purpose statement.
- D. Preview and summarize the main points you will utilize to establish and support your purpose statement.

Transition from introduction to body and your first main point.

II. Body

A. Introduce your first main point.

1. A claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

2. A different claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

3. A different claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

Transition from your first main point to your second main point.

B. Introduce your second main point.

1. A claim to support your second main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

2. A different claim to support your second main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

Transition from your second main point to your third main point.

C. Introduce your third and final main point.

1. A claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

2. A different claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

3. A different claim to support your first main point.

a. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

- b. Supporting material to back your claim; evidence, quotes, examples, anecdotes or narratives are just some of your possibilities.

Transition from body of presentation to your conclusion.

III. Conclusion

- A. Reference back to your introduction and attention-getting device.
- B. Summarize your main points.
- C. Conclude with a memorable finish.

Opening Speech Outline Evaluation Checklist

Opening Speech Evaluation Form

Debate Topic:

Group Members:

<p>Introduction (3 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Clear, on point opening statement (Attn Getter)• Establishes need or relevance• Clearly stated purpose statement• Provides preview into what is going to be discussed		
<p>Transitions (2 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Are they incorporated successfully, and flow naturally?		
<p>Body (4 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Is each main point introduced successfully?• Does each claim provide supportive evidence? (Quote, examples, narratives etc.)		
<p>Conclusion (3 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Does it reference introduction or opening statement?• Main points are summarized• End with a memorable statement		

Team Debate Activity Evaluation Checklist (possible points = 3)

Debate Topic/Role:

Names:

Points Earned

Comments

Opening, Rebuttal, & Closing Speech

- Clear, on point opening statement
- Clear, straightforward content
- Claims show evidence of research
- Decisive and accurate information given
- Provided a strong argument and delivery
- Effectively address the statements of the opposing team
- Easy to follow

Professionalism & Engagement

- Participants seemed knowledgeable about their topic
- Adhered to debate procedures, including time allotment for arguments
- Use effective verbal and non-verbal communications
- Demonstrate proper debate decorum

Team Debate Guide

Introduction

There are many topics in diversity and social justice that are highly debatable. The topic and debates of diversity should be of the utmost importance to you because it does and will affect your everyday lives including teaching and learning.

Your team will be randomly assigned to a controversial and debatable topic that are relevant to the course content. You will participate as debater in one topic AND as decision maker for another. Assuming your role as debater and decision maker for 2 different topics, you will research the topic to obtain relevant knowledge and are expected to demonstrate in-depth understandings on the topic, presentation skills, and logical judgement during the participations.

1st Topic: Because of the phrase, “under God” the pledge of allegiance should be banned.

Active debaters:

- Group 1 Free speech organizations (e.g., American Civil Liberties Union) for topic
- Group 2 Parents for topic
- Group 3 Religious Organizations against topic
- Group 4 Parents against topic

Decision-makers

- Group 5: Virginia Department of Education
- Group 6: US Department of Education

2nd Topic: Students should be taught all major religions at elementary schools.

Active debaters:

- Group 5 Subgroup A: Parents for topic
- Group 5 Subgroup B: Religious organizations for topic
- Group 6 Subgroup A: Parents against topic
- Group 6 Subgroup B: Religious organizations against topic

Decision-makers

- Group 1 & 2: Virginia Department of Education
- Group 3 & 4: Rockingham County School District

Assignments

Team debate consists of the following components. Please consult other supporting materials in Team Debate Module in Canvas before you begin:

- 1. Annotated bibliographies for the debate topic** (individual grade; 9 points): You will need to research your topic and prepare a debate to convince the decision makers why they should “vote” a certain way. Basically, you are trying to convince the decision makers that your argument has merit. When you play as decision maker for the other topic, you will need some basic background knowledge to make fair judgement. So, your annotated bibliography will include the followings:
 - a. As debater, you will identify 3 number of scientific literature (NO blogs, YouTube clips as such kind; SEARCH recent journal articles, book or book chapters, articles from professional organizations). Use a research databased available through JMU libraries. Read 3 sources thoroughly, write 1-2 paragraphs annotation for each source. Annotation should include key information/insights you may use for your arguments. You should not rely on the published abstracts to craft your annotations. Bullet points or narrative format works fine for your annotation. Each source should be listed in APA.
 - b. As decision maker, visit the targeted organization website to collect relevant information. You can enter the topic in a search box within the site to review materials containing the keyword. Identify 3 relevant sources of information within the site and provide your annotation for each source. Annotation should include key information/insights you may need to use for your arguments, positions, and decisions. Bullet points or narrative format works fine for your annotation. Each source should be listed in APA.
 - c. You may want to save the original sources (or know how to access) so that you can utilize them conveniently for writing the opening speech outline.

- 2. Opening speech outline** (group grade; 12 points): As debater of the assigned topic, your team will write a 5-minute opening speech that contains your main talking points, and supporting materials to back up your arguments. This speech should be clear, concise, and insightful. You need to convince the decision makers that your stand is the right stand. You should consult “Debate Opening Speech Outline Guide” in Canvas and the consultants from the Communication Center. We have two consultants working with us

this semester – Gabby Richardson and Miranda Tonkins (or any other consultants available). They will hold office hours in Memorial Hall for the consultations just for you!

Room 3255:

March 18, Wednesday, 12pm-3pm

March 25, Wednesday, 12pm-3pm

Room 3230:

March 19, Thursday, 9am-11am & 1pm-2pm (room is reserved 9am-2pm)

March 26, Thursday, 9am-11am & 1pm-2pm (room is reserved 9am-2pm)

You could visit Communication Center in other times as well. The Communication Center is located in Student Success Center by Dunkin Donuts) with our online scheduler: <http://www.jmu.edu/commcenter/appointments.shtml>

- 3. Consultation with the Communication Center** (Individual grade; 3 points): You should take advantage of the Communication Center to help your opening speech persuasive and effective both for writing and speech practice stages. Preparation and practice will influence the quality of the actual debate. I would encourage you to work with the consultant as a whole team. However, in case not all members are available or willing, I will leave this as individual activity, which means that the only members who met the consultants would earn the points.
- 4. Team Debate Activity** (individual grade by peer evaluation; 3 points): Following the general debate and role play format (see below), you will participate in HEATED debates without violent behaviors 😊. Your participation should reflect high level of engagement, active listening, critical questions, and logical and thoughtful responses that are expected in your role. I understand that you may not have the same amount of opportunities to speak (in opening, rebuttal, and closing) in your team. I would still expect your team plays effectively by supporting one another based on individual's strengths and interests.

General debate and roleplay format (in-class activity): Topic 1 VS Topic 2

1. Five minute opening speech (Debater Group 1; Debater Group 5 Subgroup A)
Five minute opening speech (Debater Group 2; Debater Group 5 Subgroup B)
Five minute opening speech (Debater Group 3; Debater Group 6 Subgroup A)
Five minute opening speech (Debater Group 4; Debater Group 6 Subgroup B)
2. Questions from the decision makers (Group 5 & 6; Group 1, 2, 3, & 4) to any opening speakers for five minutes
3. Four minute rebuttal speech (Debater Group 1; Debater Group 5 Subgroup A)
Four minute rebuttal speech (Debater Group 2; Debater Group 5 Subgroup B)
Four minute rebuttal speech (Debater Group 3; Debater Group 6 Subgroup A)
Four minute rebuttal speech (Debater Group 4; Debater Group 6 Subgroup B)
4. Questions from the decision makers (Group 5 & 6; Group 1, 2, 3, & 4) to any rebuttal speakers for five minutes
5. Two minute closing speech (Debater Group 1; Debater Group 5 Subgroup A)
Two minute closing speech (Debater Group 2; Debater Group 5 Subgroup B)
Two minute closing speech (Debater Group 3; Debater Group 6 Subgroup A)
Two minute closing speech (Debater Group 4; Debater Group 6 Subgroup B)
6. Five minute class break for the decision makers (Group 5 & 6; Group 1, 2, 3, & 4) to decide
7. Two minute decision (Group 5; Group 1 & 2)
Two minute decision (Group 6; Group 3 & 4)
8. Final Questions & Discussion

Team Debate Peer Evaluation Form

*Please submit the form **no later than a week after the Debate**. This form will NOT be returned or shared.

Your Name: _____ Your Group/Role _____

Communication Center Consulting Yes Date _____ Consultant Name _____
 No Reason (optional) _____

Names of your group member **(the letter corresponds the student's name)**

a. _____ b. _____

c. _____ d. _____

Please evaluate each member's performance according to the criteria in the table. Enter your score (Excellent = 3, Average =2, Poor = 1) in the table.

	a	b	c	d
1. Knowledgeable about the assignment, expectation, and evaluation				
2. Made tangible and significant contributions				

3. Respected
each
group
member's
opinions

4. Reliable
and
available
for
meetings

5. Complete
d
assigned
tasks and
roles in a
timely
manner

*Calculate the total
score*

Summary of the conducts and overall impression of each member's performance

a. _____

b. _____

c. _____

d. _____