



Office of the Provost

School of Music

Promotion and Tenure Evaluation Guidelines

Approved: 2021

Office of the Provost
James Madison University

MSC 7607
Alumnae Hall, Room 102
91 Alumnae Drive
Harrisonburg, VA 22807
540.568.3429

SECTION XIV
CRITERIA FOR PROMOTION AND TENURE
approved 4/5/21

A. Principles and Procedures

These procedures and criteria serve the School of Music AUH (Academic Unit Head, i.e. Director of the School of Music) and AUPAC (Academic Unit Personnel Advisory Committee) in making recommendations for promotion and tenure. The School of Music strives to employ the best-qualified faculty members possible, and nothing in this document shall be construed so as to prevent the AUH or AUPAC from acting, within University policies, in pursuit of this objective.

Faculty members are bound by all standards, policies, and procedures set forth in the JMU Faculty Handbook (www.jmu.edu/facultyhandbook), the JMU Manual of Policies and Procedures (www.jmu.edu/JMUpolicy), and the School of Music Faculty Handbook. Therefore, faculty members are advised to consult these documents when preparing their review materials. See in particular JMU Faculty Handbook sections III.E.6 (standards and procedures for Promotion) and III.E.7 (standards and procedures for Tenure), both of which include details beyond those in the present document.

The AUH and AUPAC conduct the following faculty evaluations:

- First-Year Evaluations (conducted during the second full semester of employment)
- Third-Year Evaluations (conducted during the spring semester of the faculty member's third year)
- Evaluations of Tenure Applications (tenure application reviews are conducted during the fall semester of the candidate's sixth year of employment; see further details below regarding shortened review periods)
- Evaluations of Promotion Applications (conducted during the fall semester; see further details below)

Each individual case will be considered on its own merits without comparison to any other faculty member. All deliberations of the AUPAC, including review of peer evaluations, shall remain confidential. The AUPAC may, as part of its comprehensive evaluation procedures, invite limited participation of the AUH during its deliberations. However, the AUPAC and the AUH shall make independent recommendations based on their individual reviews of relevant materials. These independent recommendations shall be passed directly to the Dean.

External Review

External evaluation is a critical component of Promotion and Tenure reviews. By April 1 of the academic year preceding Promotion and/or Tenure review, candidates shall provide to the current (outgoing) AUPAC chair a list of six to ten potential reviewers. By the same date, the AUH shall also provide to the AUPAC chair a list of six to ten potential reviewers. Potential reviewers should hold a similar position at a peer-institution or higher and hold the academic rank being sought by the candidate or higher. The university regularly publishes an official list of peer-institutions. The candidate will disclose all previous and current relationships with each of their proposed reviewers. Both the candidate and the AUH shall write a one- or two-sentence rationale for each potential reviewer's inclusion on their list.

The current (outgoing) AUPAC will select eight to twelve potential reviewers from among the two lists, contact these individuals, and determine whether they are willing to complete the requested reviews. Promotion and tenure reviews must have a minimum of four external evaluation letters.

The summer prior to their Promotion and/or Tenure review, candidates will compile a digital portfolio that includes:

- a current *Curriculum vitae*
- a Narrative Statement addressing their activity during the review period in the area of Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications (This should be an excerpt of the full Narrative Statement described in the "Guidelines for Review Materials" below, but addressed to external reviewers. External reviewers are not asked to comment on the candidate's Teaching or Service activities.)
- all supporting documentation for Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications

These materials should be sent electronically to the incoming AUPAC chair, who will share them with external reviewers by August 1 with a response requested by September 15.

B. Guidelines for Review Materials

With the exception of the *curriculum vitae*, prior comprehensive evaluations, and similar required items, the candidate should limit their review materials to activities conducted during the current review period. In the case of First-Year Evaluations, Third-Year Evaluations, and Evaluations for Tenure and Promotion to Associate Professor, this includes all activities since the time of hire at JMU. In the case of Evaluations for Promotion to Full Professor, this includes activities since the last successful promotion application.

All materials must be submitted in a secure electronic format to the Chair of the AUPAC.

The format for submission is as follows:

- **Cover sheet.** This one-page sheet shall include the following information:
 - Name
 - Department
 - Current Rank and Title
 - Rank and Promotion Sought
 - If promoted from initial appointment, Present Rank and Date of promotion
 - Highest Academic Degree
 - Rank and Date of Initial JMU Faculty Appointment
- **Narrative Statement.** The narrative statement should summarize your activities and accomplishments during the review period in the areas of I. Teaching, II. Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications, and III. Professional Service, *beginning each section of the narrative with what you feel are your most significant accomplishments in that area.* The narrative may be guided in part by the provided Narrative Statement Writing Prompts (see below). Please avoid duplicate references to a given activity in multiple portions of the narrative.
- **Current Curriculum vitae**
- All previous **Annual Evaluations** and **Comprehensive AUPAC and AUH Review Letters**
- **Supporting documentation.** Please include hyperlinks to these materials when citing them in your narrative statement:
 - **Appendix 1—Teaching**
 - List of courses taught during the review period, organized by semester and including enrollment numbers
 - Student evaluations. Include all student evaluations submitted for all courses taught during the review period, either via scans of paper

evaluations or links to online evaluations. In accordance with the University Faculty Handbook III.E.2.b.(1), student evaluations will only be used as informative and not as the primary method of assessing teaching.

- Other documentation relevant to teaching
- **Appendix 2—Scholarly and Creative Activity**
 - Publications, recordings, acceptance letters, programs, conference bulletins, and other documented evidence of scholarly or creative activity
- **Appendix 3—Service**
 - Complete list of School, College, and University committees on which the candidate has served at JMU, organized by semester. Please note any Chair duties.
 - Other documented evidence of service activities, including service to JMU organizations and professional organizations

C. Standards and Criteria

Pursuant to the JMU Faculty Handbook section III.E.2.b: "The areas of performance that shall be considered in all performance evaluations are as follows:

- teaching
- scholarly achievement and professional qualifications
- professional service

Additionally, any aspects of a faculty member's conduct that impacts performance, positive or negative, should be addressed in the evaluation of these performance areas."

The recommendations of the AUPAC and the AUH shall be based on a comprehensive review of factors including, but not limited to:

- materials submitted by the candidate
- external reviews (promotion and/or tenure reviews only)
- peer reviews
- observations of the candidate's teaching
- candidate interview with the AUPAC (promotion and/or tenure reviews only)
- any other information deemed relevant by the reviewing bodies. This includes evidence of the following behaviors, which are expected of all faculty members in the School of Music:
 - establishing constructive, supportive, ethical relationships with colleagues
 - submitting annual review and promotion and tenure materials on time and in a complete form
 - supporting the recruiting efforts of the School of Music
 - meeting classes and lessons as scheduled and teaching appropriate and well-prepared material
 - ongoing productivity in the faculty member's field
 - providing quality student advising, formally (academic advisors) and informally
 - actively supporting and participating in the musical culture of the JMU School of Music, both on and off campus
 - adherence to stated School, College, and University standards and policies

Promotion

Promotions of faculty members will be determined by merit regardless of distribution of faculty within the rank and within a school. Normally, a faculty member should have completed five years in academic rank before being reviewed for promotion. Though length of service may be given consideration, it is not sufficient basis for recommendation for promotion. If an application for tenure also includes an application for promotion, the procedures and standards to be used are the tenure procedures and standards.

Promotion Standards

Teaching, scholarly achievement and professional qualifications, and professional service are the bases for evaluating candidates for promotion. In each of these areas, the faculty member shall be evaluated as excellent, satisfactory or unsatisfactory.

In the evaluation of faculty members being considered for promotion, the following standards apply:

- Assistant Professor: at least satisfactory ratings in all three areas are required for promotion to assistant professor
- Associate Professor: an excellent rating in either teaching or scholarly achievement and professional qualifications and at least satisfactory ratings in the other two areas are required for promotion to associate professor
- Professor: excellent ratings in two areas and a satisfactory rating in the other are required for promotion to professor

Tenure

Tenure is intended to protect academic freedom, provide a reasonable measure of employment security, and enable the University to retain a permanent faculty of distinction. The Board of Visitors is the only authority that can award tenure or make a commitment that promises tenure.

The agreed probationary period preceding consideration for tenure shall be stated in the initial employment contract of a tenure-track appointment. The maximum probationary period is seven years. Applications made prior to the penultimate year of the probationary period may be considered but will receive favorable review only upon presentation of compelling evidence of accomplishment by the faculty member (see "Compelling Case for Early Tenure and/or Promotion" below). The faculty member and the AUH may agree to suspend the running of the probationary period for a specific period of time under appropriate circumstances and with the approval of the Dean. Faculty members on less than a seven-year probation may, by agreement with the AUH and with the approval of the Dean, have the probationary period extended to a maximum of seven years.

The award of tenure is based on the qualifications, performance and conduct of individual faculty members and the long-term needs, objectives and missions of the school, college and university. To be awarded tenure, the faculty member must meet performance and conduct standards required for promotion to associate professor and should enhance the academic environment of the academic unit and the university. Tenure may be denied on any legitimate grounds including the lack of need for a faculty member in the school or academic specialization, program reduction or elimination, financial exigency, or conduct.

Tenure Standards

Teaching, scholarly achievement and professional qualifications, and professional service are the bases for evaluating candidates for tenure. In each of these areas, the faculty member shall be evaluated as excellent, satisfactory or unsatisfactory.

The School of Music standards for recommending a faculty member for tenure are an excellent rating in either teaching or scholarly achievement and professional qualifications and at least satisfactory ratings in the other two areas.

Criteria for Promotion and Tenure

The primary criteria for achieving a rating of excellent, satisfactory, or unsatisfactory in a given area shall be based on whether the candidate:

- has not met the minimum level regarded as typical for faculty members in the candidate's field and position at an institution of JMU's profile (**Unsatisfactory**)

- has met at least the minimum level regarded as typical for faculty members in the candidate's field and position at an institution of JMU's profile (**Satisfactory**), or
- has exceeded in either quality or quantity the level regarded as typical for faculty members in the candidate's field and position at an institution of JMU's profile (**Excellent**)

Examples of activities and accomplishments that could contribute to an **Excellent** rating in a given area might include, but not be limited to:

- winning a University award or significant external award or recognition
- overseeing a major curricular improvement or originating valuable new courses
- enacting major, successful outreach or engagement initiatives in our community, region, or state
- appearing in an exceptionally large number of performances, or appearing prominently in performances that receive significant positive attention on a national or international scale
- publishing work in top-tier journals, or presenting at prestigious conferences
- producing and distribution of important sound recordings or other digital content
- directing ensembles that are invited to present at regional or national conferences
- chairing one or more committees, or serving on an unusually high number of committees
- overseeing doctoral documents that are exceptional in nature or number
- holding elected office in a national professional organization
- other major service responsibilities as outlined in job description through consultation with AUH

Note that the examples above are illustrative rather than prescriptive, and are not exhaustive; any type of activity may contribute to a rating of excellent, satisfactory, or unsatisfactory based on quality and/or quantity of activity.

Compelling Case for Early Tenure and/or Promotion

The School of Music accepts applications for early tenure and/or promotion only if the faculty member can make a compelling case for exceptional teaching, professional service, and scholarly achievement, and professional qualifications. A faculty member whose application for early tenure and promotion to the rank of associate professor is denied will receive a terminal contract for the next academic year. A faculty member whose application for early promotion to the rank of full professor is denied may not reapply for promotion during the following academic year.

Standards for Early Tenure and/or Promotion

To present a compelling case for early tenure and promotion to the rank of associate professor a faculty member must demonstrate a level of achievement considered "excellent" in the AUPAC and the AUH reviews for Promotion and Tenure in the two areas of teaching and scholarly/creative activity and at least a "satisfactory" in the area of service.

To present a compelling case for early promotion to the rank of professor a faculty member must demonstrate a level of achievement of "excellent" in the AUPAC and the AUH reviews for Promotion and Tenure in all three areas. The AUPAC and AUH will determine whether the levels of achievement in each area and the overall level of accomplishment are sufficient to warrant an affirmative recommendation for early promotion and/or tenure.

Any faculty member contemplating early application for tenure and/or promotion must first submit a preliminary dossier including a current *Curriculum vitae* and other supporting documents to the AUH before consideration by the AUPAC or external reviewers. A faculty member applying for early promotion and/or tenure must notify the current (outgoing) AUPAC chair by April 1st of the academic year before the promotion/tenure review. The outgoing AUPAC chair will notify the newly elected AUPAC chair of any early applications for promotion and/or tenure.

External reviewers must be asked by the AUPAC chair to comment specifically on the special grounds for an early decision. The AUH and the AUPAC must also specifically address this issue in their letters that accompany the application.

Narrative Statement Writing Prompts

The narrative statement offers candidates the opportunity to illustrate that they have met or exceeded the standards for the rank and/or tenure status to which they aspire. The **writing prompts** below are intended to aid candidates in that undertaking, and are not exhaustive. It is not expected that a faculty member will engage in all of the activities listed, nor is it expected that a faculty member will be equally active in each of the three areas. The question of what constitutes an appropriate balance for a given faculty member should be discussed with the AUH before the evaluation process begins.

I. Teaching

In the Teaching narrative, candidates are encouraged to detail their:

- **Teaching Philosophy**
 - Articulate teaching methodologies.
 - Efforts to improve the curriculum to reflect teaching philosophy.
 - Contributions to student success.
- **Teaching Duties**
 - Efforts to keep abreast of developments in their individual field and to reflect these developments in teaching.
 - Extra teaching assignments above and beyond their normal workload.
- **Work with Students**
 - Evaluations by peers and/or AUHs.
 - Efforts in student mentoring and commitment to student advising.
 - Student evaluations of the course content, assignments, learning experiences, and intellectual challenges.
 - Efforts to respond appropriately to student evaluations.
 - Accessibility to students outside of class.
 - Work to prepare students for auditions, competitions and other performance, publication, or presentation opportunities.
 - Service as director or adviser of honors projects, internships, or independent study projects.
 - Service on graduate student document, recital, and comprehensive exam committees.
 - Use of outside resources and instructional alternatives such as guest speakers and field trips.
- **Student Accomplishments**
 - Present and former students' success in musical competitions, scholarly presentations, publications, notable performances, and other accomplishments in their field.
 - Present and former students' success in job placement, graduate school placement, and preparedness for graduate entrance examinations.
 - Ensemble invitations to perform at regional or national conferences and conventions, whether or not budget allows said performances to take place.
 - Ensembles' success in competitions or selection for awards or other honors.
- **Recruiting and Outreach Activities**
 - Efforts to recruit and attract students.
 - Master classes, clinics, or invitations to serve as a guest artist or scholar in their major area for organizations outside the university.

- **Curricular Development**
 - Origination or development of courses or curricula that add depth to the program.
 - Major or innovative revisions to course material.
 - Acquisition of JMU or external grants for instructional development.

II. Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications

In the Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications narrative, candidates are encouraged to detail their:

- **Performances:**
 - Performances on and off campus as a conductor, soloist, ensemble member, or operatic stage director.
 - Appearances on campus as a principal performer in a recital.
 - Appearances on campus as a member of a faculty ensemble, as a guest artist in a student ensemble performance, or as a collaborator in faculty or student recitals.
 - Performances and invitations to serve as conductor of regional, all-state, or other select ensembles.
 - Performances of the candidate's original musical compositions or arrangements.
- **Publications, Presentations, and Productions:**
 - Scholarly presentations on and off campus as a speaker, panelist, clinician, consultant, or as director of a workshop or institute.
 - Publications as author, co-author, or editor of articles or reviews in professional journals.
 - Publications as an author, co-author, or editor of books, chapters in books, monographs, entries in major reference works, or other important works.
 - Publication and commissions of musical compositions or arrangements.
 - Performance of, composition for, or production of recordings for distribution or broadcast.
 - Service as an ensemble clinician.
- **Recognition and Research Impact:**
 - Presentations, performances, publications, or productions of outstanding quality, especially those that receive national or international recognition.
 - Winning of prizes, fellowships, or other recognition.
 - Notable contributions to the state of knowledge in the faculty member's field of specialization.
 - Published work being referenced by other scholars.
- **Additional Study:**
 - Attendance at or participation in master classes, clinics, and conferences.
 - Study toward or completion of an additional degree or certification.
 - Course work or applied study with master teachers.
 - Informal study or professional experience of exceptional quality.

III. Professional Service

In the Professional Service narrative, candidates are encouraged to detail their:

- **Service to JMU:**
 - Service on committees of the School of Music, College of Visual and Performing Arts and the University.
 - Service as chair or leader of committees or other official activities of the School of Music, College of Visual and Performing Arts, and the University.
 - Service as an area coordinator, director, inter-area coordinator, supervisor, or administrator.

- Service as a faculty advisor to student organizations or ensembles.
- Additional duties on campus.
- Fundraising, grant writing, or public relations work on behalf of the School, College, or University.
- **Service outside of JMU:**
 - Service to professional associations outside the university.
 - Adjudicating and consulting services.
 - Outreach or engagement initiatives in the community, region, or state.
 - Evaluations of prospective publications.
 - Service as a session chair, program committee member, or other duty for a conference.

Approved by the Dean of CVPA: December 17, 2021

Approved by the Provost: December 30, 2021