School of Art, Design and Art History

Annual Evaluation Guidelines

Approved: 2022
School of Art, Design and Art History

Guidelines and Criteria for Evaluating Teaching, Professional Service, and Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications for Annual Evaluations

Introduction

This document establishes the procedures and criteria for evaluating the areas of Teaching, Professional Service, and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications that are required for Annual Evaluations.

Annual Evaluations of all full-time faculty members are conducted after the conclusion of each academic year, based on an annual report provided by the faculty member by May 15. Reports should cover activities from mid-May of the prior year to mid-May of the reporting year.

Faculty members in the School of Art, Design and Art History, as members of the College of Visual and Performing Arts, are evaluated using criteria established in the James Madison University Faculty Handbook.

However, since the activities for Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications and for Professional Service vary significantly among the college disciplines, and since teaching activities vary significantly even within the various areas of the School, this document provides specialized guidelines on the types of activities to be considered and the criteria to be used in the evaluation process and within each area.

Since the criteria for achieving a rating of “excellent” or “satisfactory” within Teaching, Professional Service, and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications may vary by discipline, this document also seeks to clarify expectations by defining the three rating categories of “Excellent,” “Satisfactory,” and “Unsatisfactory” for all areas within the School. It is, of course, possible that new and different activities will arise which will prove just as important as those that have been specifically listed. In addition, in cases where an activity could fit in more than one category, it is up to the faculty member to decide on the placement and to provide the framework for it. For example, acting as a sponsor of a student club or organizing a student forum could be placed under either teaching or service, depending on how the activity is presented.
Additionally, the guidelines and criteria in this document recognize and honor the work conducted by faculty with diverse responsibilities, and they recognize and honor faculty who collaborate, cooperate, and contribute to the shared Mission of the School of Art, Design and Art History.

**Mission**

We collaborate as creators and scholars to advance diversity and independent thought through rigorous practice and research.

**Annual Faculty Activity Reports**

Maintaining thorough and accurate Annual Faculty Activity Reports is an ongoing responsibility of both tenured and non-tenured faculty. These reports, as well as supporting evidence, are of prime importance when evaluating faculty. It is critical that these documents be carefully prepared to accurately reflect the faculty member’s progress.

The Annual Faculty Activity Report includes information summarizing the activities and accomplishments in Teaching, Professional Service, and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications completed during the review period. It is written in a resume style and closely follows the report structure. The faculty member may include a brief descriptive narrative for each section and may select choice pieces of evidence to submit, such as exhibition announcements or articles, yet the information in the reports is meant to be easily read and concise.

Self-evaluations for Teaching, Professional Service, and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications are part of the Annual Faculty Activity Report. The Self-evaluations should relate to the guidelines and criteria of this document and the rating should reflect the achievements within the specified Annual Faculty Activity Report category. The faculty member must use the same rating scale (below) that is used by the School Director. The faculty member may include a brief narrative in support of the rating they selected, but there is no need to re-summarize all of the points already listed in the report.
**Rating Scale for Evaluation of performance in each area (higher is better):**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unsatisfactory</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As required by the Faculty Handbook, a Faculty Activity Plan must be submitted along with the Annual Faculty Activity Report for review by the AUH. In this document, the faculty member must specify how they would like to weight the performance areas for the coming academic year and must describe how they plan to meet those weightings in terms of workload and activities. The form allows the faculty member to describe any special activities or projects that the faculty member plans to undertake or continue in the upcoming academic year. Teaching may range between 33.3 - 60%, with a default of 33.3%. Professional Service may range between 10 - 45%, with a default of 33.3%. Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications may range between 20 - 50%, with a default of 33.3%. Total sum weighting of the three areas must equal 100 percent.

The guidelines and criteria described in this document are also designed to assist-faculty in outlining what the College of Visual and Performing Arts in general, and the School of Art, Design and Art History in specific, expect of faculty who are completing their Initial or Third-Year Review, or who are seeking Tenure and/or Promotion.

**Procedure for Appeal of Evaluations**

Please refer to the procedures outlined in the Faculty Handbook and in the School of Art, Design and Art History Appeal Policy document.

**Faculty Adoption and Amendment of Evaluation Procedures**

Proposals related to establishing or modifying evaluation criteria used to judge faculty Teaching, Professional Service, and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications should be submitted to the school's Personnel Advisory Committee (PAC). Guidelines supported by a majority of the PAC will be presented to the entire School’s faculty for adoption. If a majority of the faculty supports the PAC’s recommendations, the results will be forwarded to the Academic Unit Head (or “School Director”) for review. If approved, the Academic Unit Head will forward the recommended standards to the CVPA Dean for review. If approved by the Provost and the Dean, the discipline’s guidelines will be utilized in all subsequent reviews.
TEACHING

Guidelines for Evaluating Teaching

Faculty Handbook III.E.2.b.1 “Consideration of teaching performance must include, but is not limited to a well-developed teaching philosophy, self-evaluation, evaluations by peers and/or AUHs, and student evaluations of the course content, assignments, learning experiences, and intellectual challenges (i.e., not only the individual style or personality of the instructor). Student evaluations may only be utilized as a formative tool or as part of a teaching portfolio. Consideration may be given to a faculty member’s commitment to student advising, student mentoring, innovations in teaching, contributions to departmental curriculum improvement, efforts to improve teaching as evidenced by development of new course work and teaching methodology, and other contributions to student success. Consideration of teaching performance may include artifacts to demonstrate student progress and learning, such as edited papers, student projects student accomplishments, testimony from students, and course portfolios (e.g. presentation material, assignments, rubrics). Any such policy shall apply equally to all similarly situated faculty members in the academic unit. Furthermore, student evaluation scores may not be the primary method by which teaching performance is evaluated.”

The full dimension of teaching should not be slighted in the desire to arrive at usable data and systematic adjudication. While Teaching can be considered apart from Professional Service and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications, the recognition of these obligations suggests that their interrelationship is important. The kind of teaching that distinguishes itself in universities is integral with scholarship, and has a way of getting outside classroom confines exemplifying the highest meaning of service. In consideration of this, these guidelines and criteria recognize the broad dimensions of teaching and are sensitive to different kinds and styles of instruction to varying student populations within the School of Art, Design and Art History.

Teaching may range between 33.3 - 60%, with a default of 33.3%, on the Faculty Activity Plan
Criteria for Evaluating Teaching

Note: These are examples of types of activities, not specific requirements, with the understanding that not all must be met in a single year. When relevant and if deemed necessary, faculty members should explain the status and/or competitive nature of particular achievements in their respective fields.

A. Several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Satisfactory performance in teaching.

- Prepares and executes courses that challenge students to achieve at the appropriate college level.
- Meets classes as scheduled and teaches well-prepared material according to University catalogue descriptions.
- Stays abreast of developments in faculty’s member’s field/s and incorporates these developments into teaching.
- Cultivates an appreciation and understanding of diverse cultural expressions, promoting equity, access, and inclusion within course content, assignments, and activities.
- Effectively supervises and manages student-teaching and/or engagement in student teaching seminar and student teaching conference day.
- Demonstrates commitment to academic advising and/or career counseling; maintains regular office hours in accordance with School policy.
- Shows evidence of solid student artwork, design work, research, writing, or other academic and/or creative projects.
- Conducts routine maintenance of studio/lab equipment, acquisitions, and facilities.
- Receives satisfactory/positive student evaluations and responds appropriately to student evaluations. In accordance with the Faculty Handbook, teaching evaluations must not be the primary or exclusive evidence of teaching effectiveness.
- Receives satisfactory/positive peer and PAC teaching observations.

B. In addition to the Satisfactory criteria that apply to the candidate, several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Excellent performance in teaching.

- Develops and implements outstanding and exemplary instructional content in faculty member’s discipline, for the undergraduate through student teaching (if relevant) and at the graduate level though the completion of the thesis (if relevant).
- Develops and implements relevant and enriching practicum experiences in school and community settings for undergraduate students seeking PreK-12 licensure.
- Effectively and broadly advises students seeking PreK-12 licensure and working professionals in the field of art education, or those seeking higher education degrees or positions.
- Effectively evaluates and records student progress toward licensure and employment.
- Takes leadership role in cultivating an appreciation and understanding of diverse cultural expressions, promoting equity, access, and inclusion within course content, assignments, and activities, and/or through development of wider programming.
- Conducts Special Topics Classes, Independent Studies, Graduate-level Directed Studies, or dual-listed graduate and undergraduate courses; teaches a wide variety of courses.
- Directs and advises undergraduate Honors Theses, Honors Projects, Internships (on and off-campus), Study Abroad Projects, and other activities that enhance undergraduate research.
- Directs or serves as member of MA or MFA Thesis Committees; serves as advisor for Graduate Teaching Assistants; participates in Graduate Semester Reviews; conducts studio visits and technical assistance, or organizes special field trips for graduate students.
- Directs and/or teaches in JMU(E) Study Abroad or leads student groups in other domestic or international study programs.
- Engages and hosts visiting artists, designers, art educators, critics, and scholars, as well as sponsors workshops and field trips to enhance curricular experience for students.
- Organizes high-impact events such as the Art History Forum, Africana Studies Conference, or exhibitions for university art galleries or for other spaces on campus or in the community.
- Creates new courses approved through C&I, new course content for an existing course (significantly revamped) or course revisions leading to new or innovative methods, including cross-disciplinary and team-taught courses.
- Coordinates/implements significant changes in the maintenance of studio/lab processes, including equipment, acquisitions, and facilities.
- Actively participates in workshops or conferences, or conducts research specifically to improve delivery of course content.
- Receives or is a finalist for university teaching award (such as Madison Distinguished Teaching Award or Provost’s Award for Excellence in Teaching); receives state, regional, national, or international teaching awards, or other public recognition of excellence in teaching.
- Receives competitive internal or external grants for instructional development.
- Publishes instructional activities in high-ranking disciplinary journals.
- Mentors junior faculty above and beyond expected obligations.
- Supervises or advises academic co-curricular/interdisciplinary activities whose quality is recognized by peers and professionals in one’s field of expertise.
- Provides evidence of outstanding student artwork, design work, research, writing, or other academic and/or creative projects.
- Provides evidence of student success, as recognized through exhibitions, publications, forums, competitions, or awards.
- Provides evidence of support, recommendations, and endorsements leading to outstanding achievements by current students or alumni, such as being selected for competitive graduate programs, internships, and/or related employment.
- Receives excellent student evaluations and gives supportive feedback, showing evidence of purposeful reflection and implementation of changes based on feedback, when appropriate. In accordance with the Faculty Handbook, teaching evaluations must not be the primary or exclusive evidence of teaching effectiveness.
- Receives excellent peer and PAC teaching observations.

C. An “Unsatisfactory” rating is defined as not meeting the standards for “Satisfactory.”
Materials to Submit for “Teaching” Area for Annual Evaluations

- Activities should be listed in resume fashion according to the Annual Report format and guidelines.

- High-quality student examinations, research papers, projects, or images of student work along with a description of the topic or assignment.

- Several of the most significant items that document your activity in the area of Teaching. The faculty member should explain what the significance of the items are in their field in terms of impact, dissemination, and/or recognition.

- A range of excellent student work. The “range” of work refers not to quality, which is expected to be high, but rather to the level of the course, whether introductory or advanced, as criteria for excellence may vary for first year and senior SADAH students, for example. To document the development of a student’s progress over time, include evidence, with a written description of such growth.

- Student self-reflections of course experiences.
PROFESSIONAL SERVICE

Guidelines for Evaluating Professional Service

Faculty Handbook III.E.2.b.(3) Evaluation of activity in this area shall include committee service and leadership at James Madison University or in professional or educational organizations, or service otherwise enhancing the profession, academic unit, college or university.

Each faculty member is expected to engage in service to the university, college, school, and/or organizations in their profession. Professional service activity is a contractual obligation that is examined and evaluated with the same level of scrutiny as teaching and creative activities. It is acceptable for new faculty to have a lighter service record in their first year on contract.

Professional Service may range between 10 - 45%, with a default of 33.3%, on the Faculty Activity Plan.

University, College and School Service

Faculty members are expected to contribute to school, college, and/or University committees, commissions, and boards that sustain the academic life of the university. Since the extent of committee responsibility varies widely, faculty should explain their individual contributions honestly and elaborate on their accomplishments.

University Service

- Gen Ed Representative, Honors Liaison, or Faculty Senate Representative.
- Interdisciplinary academic events/activities (such as Institute for Visual Studies) that serve the entire University community.
- University searches, library/ Madison Digital Image Database, technology initiatives or other committees.
- Participation in resource development or grant writing for the University.
- Participation in faculty training and development sessions (i.e. the Center for Instructional Technology, Writing Center, Center for Teaching Innovation), which leads to University outreach or enhancement.
- Sponsor of University student clubs and organizations.

- Participation in freshmen orientation, the "conversations with faculty" program, alumni outreach programs, JMU Workshop Day, Career Day, or other special events that benefit the University.

- Serving as Freshman Advisor.

**College of Visual and Performing Arts Service**

- CVPA C & I, Diversity Council, Faculty Advisory Committee, Faculty Assistance Committee, or Graduate Committee.

- Grant-writing for college activities.

- Participation or initiating interdisciplinary activities among schools in the college.

- Participation in college fund-raising activities or JMU Foundation initiatives for the college.

- Participation in activities with the Madison Art Collection, Artworks, or the Duke Gallery of Fine Art.

**School of Art, Design and Art History Service**

- Participation in regularly scheduled faculty meetings, and events such as Assessment Day and Portfolio Review Days.

- Service on school committees such as PAC, C & I, Advisory Council, or Graduate Committee and Gallery, Honors and Awards, Public Relations, Student Relations, Art Auction, Assessment, Walford Scholarship or Transfer/Change of Major Portfolio Committees.

- Service on search committees, program review committees, or other ad hoc committees.

- Service as a Peer Evaluator in the Tenure and Promotion process: successfully completing a written peer evaluation of teaching at the request of the PAC.

- Sponsor of SADAH student clubs and organizations.
- Active participation in Area meetings and duties.
- Service as an Area Coordinator, Area Head, or Lab/Studio Manager.
- Pro bono use of the faculty member’s expertise for the benefit of the school, such as design of posters and flyers, architectural sketches and plans, and documentation of student work submitted for Portfolio Review.
- Community outreach activities.

**Professional Organizations Service**

Faculty members are expected to maintain membership in and contribute to professional organizations in their fields at the local, regional, national and/or international levels. Small roles in a national or international organization or a large, high profile position for a local or regional organization are both beneficial to JMU.

- Membership in professional organizations or societies related to the arts.
- Participation in professional association conferences and meetings.
- Service as an officer for professional organizations or societies related to the arts.

**Professional Consulting and Community Service**

Other kinds of professional service may include paid or unpaid consulting services for museums, art organizations, or other institutions. Community service includes the K-12 educational system, community college or four-year institutions, and civic organizations. Service is relevant only if related to the faculty member’s field of study or at least art-related.

- Technical assistance for schools, galleries or art-related services.
- Evaluation for schools, galleries, or historic preservation.
- Paid or unpaid consulting with public agencies and arts groups.
- Leadership positions within art-related civic organizations.
Service as a juror for an arts event.

Criteria for Evaluating Professional Service
Note: These are examples of types of activities, not specific requirements, with the understanding that not all must be met in a single year. When relevant and if deemed necessary, faculty members should explain the status and/or competitive nature of particular achievements in their respective fields.

A. Several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Satisfactory performance in the area of Professional Service.

- Effectively serves on standing or ad hoc committees of the School, College, and/or University.
- Participates in community outreach initiatives on behalf of the School, College, University, or larger community.
- Develops classes or workshops for local, state, or regional organizations.
- Participates in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) initiatives on and/or off campus on behalf of the School, College, University, and/or larger community.
- Actively attends and participates as a member in state, regional, national, or international professional organizations in the faculty member’s discipline.
- Participates in regularly scheduled faculty meetings, and events such as Assessment Day and Portfolio Review Days.
- Advises student organizations in faculty member’s discipline or related discipline.

B. In addition to the Satisfactory criteria that apply to the candidate, several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Excellent performance in the area of Professional Service.

- Makes exemplary service contributions at the School, College, and/or University levels.
- Effectively serves in a SADAH leadership position, such area coordinator, chair of a standing or ad hoc committee, or other official positions in the School, College/s, and/or University.
- Exhibits outstanding commitment to community outreach and engagement in leadership role that utilizes the faculty member’s area of expertise; builds and maintains meaningful partnerships with local, state, or regional community organizations, which positively enhance the School, College, and/or University.
- Takes leadership role in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) initiatives on and/or off campus on behalf of the School, College, University, and/or larger community.
- Establishes productive partnerships with studio art, design, art education, or art
history professionals that directly benefit the School, College, and/or University.

- Exhibits outstanding efforts in state, regional, national, or international professional organizations, such as serving in a leadership position (elected or volunteer); organizing a conference or symposium; or leading a panel, session, or workshop for a conference.
- Serves as a consultant, board member, or in other leadership role at a respected museum, gallery, art center, alternative space, or arts organization at the local, state, regional, national, or international level; serves as a consultant for the Department of Education, school districts, or related educational agencies.
- Serves as an editorial board member for a prominent or peer-reviewed journal in the faculty member’s discipline.
- Takes leadership role in advising/supervising student clubs or organizations, such as Kappa Pi.
- Takes leadership role in university programming that focuses on best practices for teaching, learning, and assessment such as Center for Faculty Innovation (CFI) and Center for Assessment and Research Studies (CARS).
- Takes leadership role in maintaining the School’s alignment with accreditation standards and the primary accrediting bodies.
- Actively recruits potential students for both undergraduate and graduate programs, as well for SADAH courses, majors, minors, and concentrations.
- Actively participates in open house events, building tours, hosting school groups, Portfolio Review Days, among other events.
- Cultivates donors; seeks external funding sources; writes successful competitive internal and external grants that directly support activities of the School, College, and/or University.
- Receives or is a finalist for a university service award (such as Madison Distinguished Service Award or Provost’s Award for Excellence in Service); receives state, regional, national, or international service awards, or other public recognition of excellence in service.

C. An “Unsatisfactory” rating is defined as not meeting the standards for “Satisfactory.”

Materials to Submit for “Professional Service” Area for Annual Evaluations

- Activities should be listed in resume fashion according to the Annual Report format and guidelines.
- Several of the most significant items that document your activity in the area of Professional Service. The faculty member should explain what the significance of the items are in their field in terms of impact, dissemination, and/or recognition.
ARTISTIC AND SCHOLARLY ACHIEVEMENT AND PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATIONS

Guidelines for Evaluating Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications in Studio Art and Design

The nature of Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications and the standards for determining its quality must combine the traditions and interests of the visual arts with the more general concerns of the college and institution as a whole. It is important that the Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications for the visual arts be defined and evaluated in a manner that all faculty members, in and out of the discipline, perceive as fair and reasonable. Therefore, we have added “Artistic and” to the title of this document and specifically this section.

For most studio and design faculty members, the creation and exhibition of creative work is expected to be their main research agenda. Their output should typically reflect the medium(s) in which the faculty member is teaching. This may be wholly represented in the creation of objects or by a combination of several activities. The worlds of art and design are not homogenous or monolithic; rather each medium has its own respective cultural values and opportunities. Therefore, studio and design faculty members should describe their research achievements in the context of their respective fields and include information on the factors that determine the significance of their activities.

Research in Progress for Studio Art and Design:

For studio and design faculty, Scholarly Achievement most often means the creation of original works of art, although “art” has multiple definitions. Efforts should be made to seek exhibition opportunities for this work, and evidence for these efforts should be provided, however, new creative works that are not exhibited or that do not lend themselves to exhibition should not be disregarded. An artist may spend a great amount of time planning, drawing, designing, and/or exploring a variety of ways of creating art. This activity can be compared to and is just as valid as research done by writers or historians that adds to the overall development of an individual’s work and theoretical pursuits.

Exhibition of Studio Art and Design:

Preparation for a solo or group exhibition should be recognized at all stages. Credit should be given to the artist or designer for each stage of the artistic process. The first stage is applying for the exhibition. The second stage is acceptance and planning for
the exhibition. The third stage is the creation, selection, preparation, and promotion of the art for the exhibition. The fourth is the crating and delivery of the completed art to the exhibition venue. The fifth is on-site installation, attending openings, etc., and the sixth is de-installation, closings, etc.

Opportunities for exhibitions range from small, local group shows to international one-person shows that can reach many people. Competition is intense for most shows, and artists are often limited to exhibitions within their media of specialty. The most prestigious shows are juried or curated by experts, and vary in significance. The level of competition and breadth of the audience are particularly important points to address in describing the event.

A solo or two-person exhibition should be considered a remarkable accomplishment that crosses all three disciplines: teaching, research, and service. It not only serves as teaching aid and resource for our students but also brings national and international attention to James Madison University.

Many solo exhibitions, especially those in educational or non-profit venues offer opportunities for the artists to present gallery talks and to meet with students or others in formal or informal settings such as gallery receptions, workshops, and/or class critiques. These activities should be considered significant because of the outreach and exposure that they bring to JMU.

**Studio Art Sales/Inclusions Within Corporate, Private and Museum Collections:**

When work is purchased and/or commissioned by a well-known collector, museum, or corporation, it increases the artist’s or designer’s visibility and publicly validates the work. This cycle of institutionalization is the bedrock of building culture and can indicate significant efforts on the part of artists to “get their work out there,” and respond to the culture they operate within. Consideration must be given to the location and visibility of the collection, the reputation of the institution/collector, and the significance of the collection in art or design, and in broader cultural circles.

**Participation as a Juror, Curator, or Guest Critic:**

When a studio artist or designers are invited to serve as jurors, curators, or guest critics, it should be considered a highly regarded accomplishment. It is a reflection of the faculty member’s reputation as well as the role they play in establishing the significance of works. Factors that should be considered in regards to this activity include the prominence of the hosting venue, scope of the event (such as the length, complexity, and number of participants), the visibility of the resulting event, and the type of event being juried (book collection, exhibition, critique, etc.).
Guidelines for Evaluating Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications in Art History and Art Education

Faculty Handbook III.E.2.b.(2) Evaluation criteria in this area may differ according to discipline or area. Criteria should include, but need not be limited to, publication of scholarly works, presentations at professional conferences, achievement through performance in the arts, engaging in recognized research, obtaining research grants, continuing professional development through formal course work, publication of educational materials, and consulting activities.

Every faculty member is expected to engage in Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications activities. This is a contractual obligation that is examined and evaluated with the same level of scrutiny as Teaching and Professional Service activities. Because the nature of Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications research activities (hereafter referred to as “research”) vary so greatly among the disciplines and areas of the School of Art, Design and Art History, separate suggested examples, guidelines, criteria, and lists of materials to submit have been developed for the areas of Studio Art, Art History, Art Education, and Design. The PAC is encouraged to consult with other faculty members or professionals within a discipline if they are evaluating work in a discipline with which they are not familiar.

A faculty member whose research crosses disciplines may submit work in several categories. For example, an Art Educator may have a studio art exhibition or a Studio Artist may have a scholarly publication. Additionally, since JMU encourages scholarly research on teaching and teaching pedagogy within the various disciplines, faculty members can place publications of this nature under Scholarly Achievement or Teaching.

Scholarly publications and presentations are the main research domains for both Art Education and Art History. Qualitative, not quantitative, distinctions are to be applied to scholarly publications and presentations. Evidence of an active research program through participation at conferences, revision of articles and books in process, and submission of applications for grants are to be considered significant scholarly activities.

Research in Progress for Scholarly Publications:

An extensive amount of time is required to publish academic research. Particularly in cases where scholarship involves the investigation of primary archival source material, the research phase of a project can be highly time and resource intensive. Multiple drafts of articles are frequently required for many periodicals. Several versions of an article may be submitted to document stages of development. Evidence may include
items submitted but not accepted, or situations in which revisions were requested are
to be expected.

Considerations in Academic Publishing:

It is important that published works be judged by qualitative, not quantitative,
standards, since there are many kinds of publications. Peer reviewed articles (in most
cases) carry the highest prestige, but invited articles can rank as high in quality
depending on their circumstances and influence. Book review essays that examine the
state of a subject or field can be significant scholarly publications. Textbooks and
encyclopedia articles that are dependent on other people’s research are not weighted
as highly as more original textbooks or independent creative work. Periodicals have
their own hierarchy of prestige, even in different areas. A basic principle that affects the
weight of a publication is the way it is reviewed. A self-published book or those
uploaded to a website are not valued (at this point) the same way as a professionally
juried and published document.

Books:

Publishing a book that the faculty member authored, co-authored, edited, or co-edited,
having a manuscript accepted for publication (documented by a letter from the
publisher) or a book-in-progress being written under contract from a publisher are
considered significant. In the case of edited volumes, editors usually write the
introduction and one of the essays. Exhibition catalogs at major museums, including
noted academic museums and galleries, are equivalent to an academic book; catalogs of
smaller collections, perhaps jointly authored, might be equivalent to either a book or a
major article in a first ranking periodical.

The publication of a book should be considered a noteworthy accomplishment. If it is
within one’s discipline, it not only serves as a teaching aid and resource for our students,
but also brings national and international attention to James Madison University.
Therefore, it should be judged as an accomplishment that spans across all three
disciplines: teaching, research, and service. If the book is translated into other languages
and distributed internationally, then this prestige should be recognized. Another factor
to consider is the sole vs. collaborative authorship of the work. Additional credit should
be given to authors who also illustrate their own books.

A book authored solely or co-authored and published with a noted national or
international publisher, commercial or academic, or when the author and/or illustrator
are under contract or have completed their manuscript should be considered in the
excellent category. Credit should be given to the professor for each stage of the
publishing process. The first stage is serving under a publisher’s contract/agreement.
The second is the delivery of the completed manuscript and/or illustrations. The third stage is the actual printing of the book. Additional stages in the book printing process would include credit for having the book translated into other languages, various promotions such as book signings, advertising events, and production of supplementary material published on the Web, or in journals and newspapers.

**Periodical Publications:**

Faculty working towards tenure should maintain steady evidence of publication activity. The competitiveness of periodicals may help to define the differences between a satisfactory and excellent rating.

There are also many kinds of published academic writings to be valued. There are exhibition reviews, letters in scholarly journals, letters to the editor in national newspapers, encyclopedia articles, critical reviews, technical documents/specifications, literature reviews, articles on teaching or teaching pedagogy, “how to” articles and tutorials, etc.

**Conference Participation, Panels, and Presentations:**

A satisfactory rating for annual evaluations includes at least one significant professional contact per year. Applicants for tenure are expected to have presented papers at regional and national and/or international conferences. Faculty members should note the acceptance rate or degree of difficulty in participation at conferences. Regional conferences that are less competitive include the Valley of Virginia Consortium, the Southeastern College Art Association, and some interdisciplinary conferences focused on individual periods (“Century” Studies conferences). The College Art Association, the Renaissance Society of America, The African Studies Convention, The American Association of Museums, The American Studies Association, the National Art Education Association, and others are noted as highly competitive international conferences. Chairing a panel or presenting a paper represents a significant accomplishment under peer review. Selection as a keynote speaker carries prestige over other conference presentations.

The noteworthiness of the regional and national conference and its influence on the faculty member’s professional field are factors that determine the substance of the creative/research effort. These signify the importance of the presentations, papers and/or other refereed volumes presented during conference proceedings. Another type of lecture is one presented (invited or selected from a proposal) at a prominent lecture-series organized by a noted university, museum, or research center.
Grants, Grant-writing, Fellowships, Endowments, Honors, and Awards:

Faculty may devote a significant amount of time to writing grants in order to pursue research abroad and cover travel and publication expenses. Grant-writing, whether regional, national, or international, funded or not funded, shows scholarly activity. Faculty who receive highly competitive fellowships or grants for research at major institutions, organizations, and foundations clearly deserve an exceptional rating in the annual evaluation. Among the most competitive and prestigious granting institutions are: the National Gallery of Art (CASVA); Smithsonian Institution; Clark Art Institute; Harvard University’s Dumbarton Oaks Research Institute; National Humanities Center; J. Paul Getty Museum; National Endowment for the Humanities; National Endowment for the Arts; J. William Fulbright Foundation; Terra Foundation for American Art; Rockefeller Foundation; Guggenheim Foundation; and the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

Curating Exhibitions:

This is an important type of research and one that is of particular interest to current faculty in the SADAH.

Exhibitions and accompanying catalogues, teacher brochures, and other related publications should be evaluated in terms of their quality and scope, the prestige of the venue(s) (gallery, museum, art center, alternative space), the exhibition’s travelling/touring status, the prestige of the grants received, the reviews and awards received for the exhibition and/or catalogue, and the prestige of the publisher of the catalogue (museum, university, and/or commercial press). Often times the most cutting-edge research in a certain field is presented in exhibitions and/or published exhibition catalogues. Guest, visiting, or adjunct curators often write extensive project proposals that go through a rigorous, peer-review process within museum exhibition committees. These proposals should therefore be taken into consideration as a type of scholarly research.

Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications may range between 20 - 50%, with a default of 33.3%, on the Faculty Activity Plan.
Criteria for Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications

Note: These are examples of types of activities, not specific requirements, with the understanding that not all must be met in a single year. When relevant and if deemed necessary, faculty members should explain the status and/or competitive nature of particular achievements in their respective fields.

A. Several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Satisfactory performance in the area of Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications.

- Creates thematically or technically new body of work, even if it has not been exhibited and/or reviewed.
- Continues an existing line of art or design inquiry and production.
- Produces creative work that has significant depth and breadth relative to the medium.
- Conducts research for creative work, including travel for research, the acquisition of significant new skills, and/or collaboration.
- Seeks opportunities for exhibitions, grants, publications, and other public display of faculty member’s creative work.
- Exhibits creative work in respected local, state, regional, or national museum, gallery, art center, or alternative space; exhibits in at least one venue in addition to the Faculty Exhibition.
- Receives fellowship, grant, award, prize, trophy, medal, decoration, plaque, or ribbon for research or creative work from museum, foundation, non-profit agency, corporation, society, organization, or educational or governmental institution.
- Serves as fellow or artist/designer/educator/curator or scholar-in-residence at a residency.
- Produces creative work in arts or design for local, state, or regional venue.
- Chairs or co-chairs a panel, presents or co-presents a paper, or serves as moderator/discussant at conference in faculty member’s discipline.
- Delivers gallery talk or guest lecture or leads workshop at museum, art center, university, corporation, non-profit agency, educational or government institution, organization, society, or other consortium.
- Serves as juror, guest critic, or consultant for exhibitions, awards, or competitions.
- Publishes at least one creative work in a magazine; peer-reviewed journal; monograph; printed text; and/or website.
- Authors or co-authors an article, essay, or chapter, in academic or peer-reviewed magazine, journal, or book, for print or online publication.
- Edits or co-edits a series of articles or reviews in special issue of academic or peer-reviewed magazine or journal.
• Uploads a book to an “open source” website on art pedagogy or art education.
• Writes research article related to teaching or teaching pedagogy within faculty member’s discipline, for print or online publication.
• Exhibits continuous research activity towards publication, such as revising articles in-progress and first and second stages of development for a book.
• Writes other texts for publication such as: exhibition reviews; studio visits or “featured artist” essays; artist interviews; conference reports; letters in scholarly journals or national newspapers; encyclopedia articles; technical documents/specifications; and other critical writings such as book, literature, or film reviews.
• Completes additional study: coursework beyond the terminal degree; private applied study with master teachers; participation in master classes, clinics, workshops, and conferences.
• Maintains professional licensure in faculty member’s discipline.

B. In addition to the Satisfactory criteria that apply to the candidate, several of the following items, when relevant, indicate Excellent performance in the area of Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications.

• Exhibits significant body of creative work, in which a large scope is represented, as in a retrospective, at prominent venue, including regional, national, or internationally recognized museum, gallery, art center, or alternative space.
• Exhibits a significant body of new work at prominent venue.
• Exhibits in solo or small group exhibition, juried or invitational.
• For art educators, engages in both the production and exhibition of studio work.
• Publishes several artworks, designs, or curated exhibitions in prestigious or peer-reviewed monograph, exhibition catalogue, magazine, journal, and/or printed text.
• Faculty member interviewed for prominent magazine, newspaper, or peer-reviewed journal; or by prominent radio, podcast, television, or online program.
• Faculty member’s exhibition (as artist or guest curator) reviewed in national or international newspaper, magazine, or peer-reviewed journal.
• Faculty members’ creative work is purchased by gallery, museum, corporation, non-profit agency, educational or governmental organization, or by noted private collector.
• Faculty member’s creative work is represented by noted gallery: local, state, regional, national, or international.
• Receives or is a finalist for highly competitive university research award (such as Madison Distinguished Scholar Award or Provost’s Award for Excellence in
Scholarship);

- Receives highly competitive external fellowship, grant, award, prize, honor, trophy, medal, decoration, plaque, or ribbon for research or creative work from distinguished museum, foundation, non-profit agency, corporation, society, organization, or educational or governmental institution.

- Serves as fellow or artist/designer/educator/curator or scholar-in-residence at competitive, prominent residency, national or international.

- Designs and constructs a building, interior, mural, sculpture, weaving/tapestry, installation, or other artwork or design that will be on temporary or permanent display or that was chosen as a finalist or alternate in a competitive process.

- Builds and/or designs commissions or projects completed in collaboration with other design professionals.

- Designs local exhibitions or travelling national or international exhibitions.

- Submits work to national or international art or design competitions.

- Serves as consultant on client-centered projects and commissions that involve the design and completion of products.

- Serves as juror, guest critic, or consultant for exhibitions, awards, or competitions at prominent national or international venue.

- Develops and submits successful panel proposal, chairs or co-chairs a panel, presents or co-presents a paper, or serves as moderator/discussant at prominent state, regional, national, or international conference in faculty member’s discipline.

- Delivers gallery talk or guest lecture in a distinguished/endowed lecture series; or leads workshop at prominent museum, university, non-profit agency, corporation, organization, society, or other important consortium.

- Authors or co-authors a book published by peer-reviewed academic or commercial press with national or international standing.

- Edits or co-edits a book published by peer-reviewed academic or commercial press with national or international standing.

- Secures a book contract for a completed manuscript; or documents evidence of exceptional research activity and/or progress towards book publication.

- Authors or co-authors an article published in scholarly, peer-reviewed journal or prestigious magazine, in print or online publication.

- Authors or co-authors chapter/s in a book, monograph, exhibition catalogue, or edited volume, published by peer-reviewed academic or commercial press with national or international standing.

- Authors white papers or other forms of juried, peer-reviewed, or invited online publications.

- Serves as editor or co-editor of leading regional, national, or international peer-reviewed journal.

- Writes research article related to teaching or teaching pedagogy within faculty member’s discipline for peer-reviewed publication.

- Conducts and documents through publications, websites, or presentations, community engaged scholarship pertaining to art education.
▪ Authors or edits educational materials produced by the Department of Education.
▪ Serves as visiting or guest curator at prominent museum, gallery, art center, or alternative space.
▪ Curates exhibitions at Duke Gallery; New Image; Madison Art Collection/Lisanby Museum, or at other campus or local art space; aligns faculty member’s course content through contributing to published catalogues; organizing educational activities or public programming; and overseeing student research or the creation of instructional content based on these exhibitions.
▪ Receives competitive visiting artist/designer/educator/scholar or guest professor appointment at prominent or prestigious national or international college, university, or research institute.
▪ Completes a degree, or is awarded an honorary degree from an accredited college or university (or equivalent status) beyond the terminal degree.

C. An “Unsatisfactory” rating is defined as not meeting the standards for “Satisfactory.”

Materials to Submit for Artistic and Scholarly Achievement and Professional Qualifications for Annual Evaluations

▪ Activities should be listed in resume fashion according to the Annual Report format and guidelines including the breadth of the audience and the selection process. A description of your Studio or Design Research in Progress, images of the work, and a narrative description.

▪ Selected, annotated documentation of work and/or publications that document your activity in the area of Scholarly Research and Professional Qualifications.

Approved by the SADAH Faculty on March 25, 2022
Approved by the Dean of CVPA: April 11, 2022
Approved by the Provost: April 19, 2022