

CRITERIA FOR PROMOTION AND TENURE DECISIONS

DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS

JAMES MADISON UNIVERSITY

Adopted Summer 1982

Amended May 1983, October 1983, April/May 1988,

May 1993, October 1996, May 2002, February 2009

I. INTRODUCTION

The following criteria are presented as sufficient conditions for promotion and tenure in the Department of Economics.

By stating that these criteria are sufficient conditions, the department means that any candidate satisfying the pertinent criteria shall receive positive recommendation of the P.A.C. for promotion and/or tenure without being required to produce additional evidence of performance beyond that described below. It is to be understood that a positive recommendation for the award of tenure shall be based on receipt of at least 1 rating of exceptional and 2 ratings of satisfactory in the three performance areas.

These criteria are explicitly not to be interpreted as necessary (minimum required) conditions for promotion and tenure decisions. Thus, a candidate who does not satisfy the criteria described below may still receive a positive recommendation of the P.A.C. for promotion and/or tenure. In such a circumstance, however, the candidate will be required to specify fully how and why her or his activities represent equivalent achievement which merits that positive recommendation.

It is the responsibility of the candidate for P.A.C. action to assemble and present data and supporting documentation for the use of the P.A.C. by September 20 (i.e., 30 days prior to the date by which the P.A.C. decision must be rendered, according to the J.M.U. Faculty Handbook).

For the purposes of this document, the following definitions apply.

1. BASE PERIOD = Time since:

(a) last promotion other than to Assistant Professor, or

(b) date of hiring if later than the date of last promotion other than to Assistant Professor or

(C) [as it pertains to research criteria for promotion to Full Professor], the day after the PAC last rendered a positive decision on promotion to Associate Professor and [as it pertains to teaching and service criteria for promotion to Full Professor], September 1 of the year that the PAC last rendered a positive decision on promotion to Associate Professor.

2. P.A.C. = The P.A.C. shall consist of those otherwise-eligible department members who agree in writing in advance to abide by the procedures detailed in this document. Such an agreement shall not be construed, however, as an abrogation of the individual's right to abstain on a particular vote as a member of the P.A.C. when the sufficient conditions have not been met. Non-tenured faculty members are excluded from voting on decisions regarding promotion to Full Professor, i.e., only tenured faculty members will vote on decisions regarding promotion to Full Professor. Also, non-tenured faculty members are excluded from voting on decisions regarding promotion to Associate Professor, i.e., only tenured faculty members will vote on decisions regarding promotion to Associate Professor.

II. AMENDMENT PROCEDURE

Any proposal to modify this document must be submitted to the departmental faculty at least two (2) weeks in advance of a meeting on that proposal. A proposal to amend will be approved when there are affirmative votes from at least two-thirds (2/3) of the full-time, tenure-track members of the department (excluding administrators and persons on leave). Friendly amendments to a written proposal to modify this document may be voted upon at the meeting to consider the proposal. Other amendments will be voted on no sooner than one week later. Absentee votes on written proposals will be accepted.

Any changes in the promotion and tenure standards for sufficient conditions for teaching, research and service shall take effect one year subsequent to their adoption.

All proposed changes to the "Attachment. . ." section of this document must fulfill the following set of requirements.

1. The proposal will be submitted, in writing, at least two weeks prior to the formal consideration by the Committee of the Whole to Revise the Promotion/Tenure Document.
2. The proposal must be signed by at least two full-time, tenure-track members of the Department of Economics.
3. A proposal is limited to one specific action item for a particular journal.
4. The proposal will be accompanied by a statement in writing that specifies the substantive basis for the proposed action.

III. TEACHING

Determination that a candidate for tenure or for promotion to Associate or Full Professor is either unsatisfactory, satisfactory, or exceptional, will be made by members of the PAC on the basis of their professional judgment and should be consideration of evidence drawn from the quality, appropriateness, thoroughness, and currentness of syllabi; outlines, exams, and other course materials; student evaluations, both written and numerical; grade point averages earned in courses; peer evaluations of classroom performance; performance of students on departmental or university assessment instruments, if available; data from exit interviews or alumni reports on teaching performance; innovativeness of teaching methods or techniques; and support for students writing

honors theses and independent studies projects.

IV. RESEARCH

A. Sufficient conditions for the various ratings are as follows:

1. Promotion to Associate Professor or Receipt of Tenure

Satisfactory: A stock of research consisting of two (2) articles and eight (8) research points in total.

Exceptional: A stock of research consisting of three (3) publications, two (2) of which must be articles, and sixteen (16) research points in total.

2. Promotion to Full Professor

Satisfactory: A stock of research consisting of three (3) articles and sixteen (16) research points in total.

Exceptional : A stock of research consisting of five (5) publications, three (3) of which must be articles, and thirty-two (32) research points in total.

B. NOTE: Research point totals must meet the following requirements:

1. Articles must account for at least 50% of the required total points.

2. Articles in ranked journals must account for at least 30% of the required total points.

3. For promotion to Full Professor, at least 40% of the required total points must have been earned in the base period and one article must be sole authored.

C. Research points may be earned according to the following scheme:

1. For articles accepted after 5/1/94

(I) Article in Top Ranked journal.....11 points

(ii) Article in Second Ranked journal.....7 points

(iii) Article in Third Ranked journal.....4 points

(iv) Article in other Journal indexed

in the Journal of Economic Literature.....2 points

(v) Article in other refereed economics or

cognate discipline journal.....1 point

2. For articles accepted after 3/1/88 and before 5/1/94

(I) Article in Top Ranked journal.....11 points

- (ii) Article in Second Ranked journal.....7 points
- (iii) Article in Third Ranked journal.....4 points
- (iv) Article in other journal listed in the
Journal of Economic Literature.....3 points
- (v) Article in other refereed economics or
cognate discipline journal*.....2-4 points

3. For articles accepted before 3/1/88

- (I) Article in Top Ranked journal.....11 points
- (ii) Article in Second Ranked journal.....8 points
- (iii) Article in Third Ranked journal.....6 points
- (iv) Article in Fourth Ranked journal.....4 points
- (v) Article in other journal listed in the
Journal of Economic Literature.....3 points
- (vi) Article in other refereed economics or
cognate discipline journal*.....2-4 points

*It is the responsibility of the candidate to specify and justify, using a published quantitative instrument of journal rankings, what he/she believes is the proper point assignment within the range of 2-4 points.

4. Lists of the specific journals comprising the categories (I)-(iv) (pre-3/1/88) and (i)-(iii) (post-3/1/88) are attached. The points assignable to any publication will be determined by the ranking categorization scheme in effect at the date of the publication's acceptance.

5. NOTE: A comment or note in a journal will be assigned one-half (1/2) of the points that would be assigned to an article in the same journal. Publications in journal categories (i) through (iv) [after 3/1/88] and (I) through (v) [before 3/1/88] which are sole authored will have their point values multiplied by a factor of 1.2.

D. Alternate research vehicles

Monographs, chapters in books, textbooks, published proceedings papers and book reviews are legitimate alternate research vehicles. However, given the differences in goals, audiences, and quality, it is virtually impossible for the department to design a weighting scheme or specify the appropriate rates of substitution between these alternate research vehicles. This, it must be the responsibility of the candidate to specify the points that he or she believes to be appropriate for an alternate research vehicle and to provide a justification for that point specification.

V. SERVICE

Determination that a candidate for tenure or for promotion to Associate or Full Professor is either unsatisfactory, satisfactory, or exceptional, will be made by the members of the PAC on the basis of their professional judgment. Entering into that judgment should be evidence regarding the quantity and quality of their service activities for the Department of Economics, the College of Business, James Madison University as a whole, the economics profession as a whole, the academic community as a whole, and the non-academic community at large, both locally and more widely.

VI. THIRD-YEAR REVIEWS OF TENURE-TRACK FACULTY

The PAC will conduct a "third year" evaluation of all tenure-track Faculty in the spring of the faculty member's third year at JMU. The faculty member will submit to the PAC (by March 1st of the third year) a report on his/her scholarship and service activity in addition to copies of course syllabi, examinations, student evaluations, a statement of the faculty member's teaching philosophy, and other materials related to teaching (including any materials requested by the PAC). The faculty member's progress toward tenure and promotion with respect to teaching, research, and service will be evaluated and reported to the faculty member in the form of a letter (by April 15th). A copy of this letter will be placed in the faculty member's permanent file.

ATTACHMENT

Journal categories pertinent to the research criteria for promotion and tenure

IN RE: Categories pertinent to publications before 3/1/88.

The journals comprising categories (i) through (iv) have been identified by the unions of quality rankings appearing in the following sources: C. C. McDonough. "The Relative Quality of Economics Journals Revisited," *Quarterly Review of Economics and Business* (Spring 1975) 15:91-97 and R.G. Hawkins, L.S. Ritter and I. Walter. "What Economists Think of Their Journals," *Journal of Political Economy* (July/August 1973) 81:1017-1032. More specifically, the category (i) group is the union of the top 10 journals from each study; category (ii) is the union of 11th-20th journals; category (iii) is the union of the 21st-40th journals; and category (iv) is the union of all other journals ranked in either of the two studies.

The journals in category (v) are those not appearing in categories (i) through (iv) but which are regularly listed in the *Journal of Economic Literature*. This list was compiled by consulting 1 year of JEL issues beginning with volume 19, no. 3 (September 1981) and ending with volume 20, no. 2 (June 1982).

IN RE: Categories pertinent to publications 3/1/88 - 5/1/94.

The modified categorization scheme is based on the prior scheme and information in S.J. Liebowitz and J.P. Palmer. "Assessing the Relative Impacts of Economics Journals," *Journal of Economic Literature* (March 1984) 22:77-88. Modification included reranking some journals, preserving the number of journals in the top-rated category, combining the second and third categories into a single rank, and expanding the enumeration of journals listed in the JEL by consulting 1 year of JEL issues beginning with volume 27, no. 3 (September 1989) and ending with volume 28, no. 2 (June 1990).

IN RE: Categories pertinent to publications after 5/1/94.

The modified categorization scheme is based on the prior scheme, on information in R.B. Archibald and D.H. Finifter. "Multivariate Citation Functions and Journal Rankings," *Eastern Economic Journal* (April-June 1990) 16:151-58, and on 1993 communication with the Editor of the *Journal of Economic Literature*.

Modification included reranking some journals, reducing the points awarded to publications in lower ranked categories and shifting the responsibility to the candidate for demonstrating that a journal not in categories (i) to (iii) is JEL indexed.

Categories for publications prior to 3/1/88

(i) TOP RANKED

American Economic Review

Economic Journal

Econometrica

Economica

International Economic Review

Journal of Economic Theory

Journal of Political Economy
Journal of the American Statistical Association
Oxford Economic Papers
Quarterly Journal of Economics
Review of Economics and Statistics
Review of Economic Studies
(ii) SECOND RANKED
Annals of Mathematical Statistics
Canadian Journal of Economics
Economic Development and Cultural Change
Journal of Money, Credit and Banking
Journal of Business
Journal of Economic History
Journal of Economic Literature
Journal of Finance
Journal of Law and Economics
Journal of International Economics
Kyklos
Southern Economic Journal
(iii) THIRD RANKED
Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science
Banca nazionale del Lavoro
Quarterly Review
Bell Journal
Economic Inquiry
Economic Record
Economia Internazionale
Harvard Business Review
Industrial and Labor Relations Review
Journal of Applied Economics
Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis
Journal of Human Resources
Journal of Industrial Economics
Journal of Regional Science
Land Economics
Management Science
Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies
National Tax Journal
Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics
Public Choice
Public Finance
Public Interest
Quarterly Review of Economics and Business
Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv
(iv) FOURTH RANKED
American Journal of Economics and Sociology
Antitrust Bulletin
Applied Economics
Banker
Business Economics
European Economic Review
Economic Geography
Financial Analysts Journal
Finanz-Archiv
Growth and Change
Indian Economic Review

Industrial Relations
Inter-American Economic Affairs
International Development Review
Journal of Development Studies
Journal of Developing Areas
Journal of Econometrics
Journal of Economic Education
Journal of Economic Issues
Journal of Environmental Economics and Management
Journal of Monetary Economics
Journal of Urban Economics
Lloyds Bank Review
Metroeconomica
Moorgates Wall Street
National Westminster Bank Review
Public Policy (Now: Journal of Policy Analysis & Management)
Regional Science Assoc. Papers and Proceedings
Review of Income and Wealth
Review of Radical Political Economy
Review of Social Economy
Science and Society
Scottish Journal of Political Economy
Sloan Management Review
South African Journal of Economics
Three Banks Review
Tijdschrift Voor Economie en Management
Trans-Action
Yorkshire Bulletin of Economic and Social Research
Zeitschrift fur die Gesamte
Stratswissenschaft
Zeitschrift Nationaloekonomie

Categories for publications 3/1/88 - 5/1/94

(i) TOP RANKED

American Economic Review
Economic Journal
Econometrica
Economica
International Economic Review
Journal of Economic Literature
Journal of Economic Theory
Journal of Monetary Economics
Journal of Political Economy
Quarterly Journal of Economics
Review of Economics and Statistics
Review of Economic Studies

(ii) SECOND RANKED

Bell Journal (NOW: Rand Journal of Economics)
Brookings Papers on Economic Activity
Canadian Journal of Economics
Economic Development and Cultural Change
Economic Inquiry
Economic Record
Industrial and Labor Relations Review
Journal of Accounting Research
Journal of Business
Journal of Econometrics
Journal of Economic History
Journal of Finance
Journal of Financial and
Quantitative Analysis
Journal of Financial Economics
Journal of Human Resources
Journal of Industrial Economics
Journal of International Economics
Journal of Law and Economics
Journal of Legal Studies
Journal of Mathematical Economics
Journal of Money, Credit and Banking
Journal of Public Economics
Journal of Regional Science
Journal of Urban Economics
Journal of the American Statistical Association
Kyklos
Land Economics
Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies
National Tax Journal
Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics
Oxford Economic Papers
Public Choice
Public Finance
Quarterly Review of Economics and Business
Scandinavian Journal of Economics
Southern Economic Journal
Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv

(iii) THIRD RANKED

American Journal of Agricultural Economics
American Journal of Economics and Sociology

Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science
Annals of Mathematical Statistics
Applied Economics
Banca Nazionale del Lavoro
Quarterly Review
British Journal of Industrial Relations
Economia Internazionale
Economic Geography
Economics Letters
European Economic Review
Explorations in Economic History
Harvard Business Review
History of Political Economy
Industrial Relations
Inquiry
Journal of Applied Economics
Journal of Consumer Research
Journal of Development Economics
Journal of Development Studies
Journal of Developing Areas
Journal of Economic Education
Journal of Economic Issues
Journal of Economics and Business
Journal of Environmental Economics and Management
Journal of Risk and Insurance
Journal of Royal Statistical Society Association A & B
Lloyds Bank Review
Management Science
Monthly Labor Review
Nebraska Journal of Economics and Business

Public Policy (Now: Journal of Policy Analysis & Management)

Public Interest

Regional Science and Urban Economics

Review of Social Economy

Science and Society

Scottish Journal of Political Economy

Sloan Management Review

Urban Studies

Yale Law Journal

Categories for publications 5/1//94 - 7/1/95

(i) TOP RANKED

American Economic Review

Economic Journal

Econometrica

Economica

International Economic Review

Journal of Economic Literature

Journal of Economic Theory

Journal of Monetary Economics

Journal of Political Economy

Quarterly Journal of Economics

Review of Economics and Statistics

Review of Economic Studies

(ii) SECOND RANKED

Brookings Papers on Economic Activity

Canadian Journal of Economics

Economic Development and Cultural Change

Economic Inquiry

Economic Record

Industrial and Labor Relations Review

Journal of Accounting Research

Journal of Business

Journal of the American Statistical Association

Journal of Econometrics

Journal of Economic History

Journal of Economic Perspectives

Journal of Finance

Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis

Journal of Financial Economics

Journal of Human Resources

Journal of Industrial Economics

Journal of International Economics

Journal of Law and Economics

Journal of Legal Studies

Journal of Mathematical Economics

Journal of Money Credit and Banking

Journal of Public Economics

Journal of Regional Science

Journal of Urban Economics

Kyklos

Land Economics

Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies

National Tax Journal

Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics

Oxford Economic Papers

Public Choice

Public Finance
Scandinavian Journal of Economics
Southern Economic Journal
Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv
(iii) THIRD RANKED
American Journal of Agricultural Economics
American Journal of Economics and Sociology
Applied Economics
British Journal of Industrial Relations
Cambridge Journal of Economics
Carnegie-Rochester Series on Public Policy
Economic Geography
Economic History Review
Economics Letters
European Economic Review
Explorations in Economic History
History of Political Economy
Industrial Relations
Inquiry
International Journal of Industrial Organization
International Monetary Fund Staff Papers
Journal of Business and Economic Statistics
Journal of Comparative Economics
Journal of Consumer Research
Journal of Developing Areas
Journal of Development Economics
Journal of Development Studies
Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization
Journal of Economic Education

Journal of Economic Issues
Journal of Economics and Business
Journal of Environmental Economics and Management
Journal of Health Economics
Journal of International Money and Finance
Journal of Labor Economics
Journal of Post Keynesian Economics
Journal of Risk and Insurance
Journal of Royal Statistical
Society Association A & B
Lloyds Bank Review
Monthly Labor Review
Nebraska Journal of Economics and Business
Public Finance Quarterly
Quarterly Review of Economics and Business
Regional Science and Urban Economics
Review of Income and Wealth
Review of Social Economy
Science and Society
Scottish Journal of Political Economy
Sloan Management Review
Urban Studies
Yale Law Journal
Categories for publications after 7/1/95
(i) TOP RANKED
American Economic Review
Economic Journal
Econometrica
International Economic Review
Journal of Economic Literature
Journal of Economic Theory
Journal of Finance
Journal of Financial Economics
Journal of Monetary Economics
Journal of Political Economy
Quarterly Journal of Economics
Rand Journal of Economics
Review of Economics and Statistics
Review of Economic Studies
(ii) SECOND RANKED
Brookings Papers on Economic Activity
Canadian Journal of Economics
Economic Inquiry
Economics Letters
Economica
Economic Record
International Journal of Industrial Organization
Industrial and Labor Relations Review
Journal of Accounting Research
Journal of Banking and Finance
Journal of Business
Journal of the American Statistical Association
Journal of Business and Economic Statistics
Journal of Econometrics
Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control
Journal of Economic Education

Journal of Economic History
Journal of Economic Perspectives
Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis
Journal of Human Resources
Journal of Industrial Economics
Journal of International Economics
Journal of Labor Economics
Journal of Law and Economics
Journal of Legal Studies
Journal of Mathematical Economics
Journal of Money Credit and Banking
Journal of Public Economics
Journal of Regional Science
Journal of Urban Economics
Kyklos
Land Economics
Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies
National Tax Journal
Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics
Oxford Economic Papers
Public Choice
Public Finance
Scandinavian Journal of Economics
Social Choice and Welfare
Southern Economic Journal
Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv
(iii) THIRD RANKED

American Journal of Agricultural Economics
American Journal of Economics and Sociology
Applied Economics
British Journal of Industrial Relations
Cambridge Journal of Economics
Carnegie-Rochester Series on Public Policy
Cato Journal
Demography
Eastern Economic Journal
Econometric Theory
Economic Development and Cultural Change
Economic Geography
Economic History Review
Economic Record
European Economic Review
Explorations in Economic History
History of Political Economy
Industrial Relations
Inquiry
International Monetary Fund Staff Papers
Journal of Comparative Economics
Journal of Consumer Research
Journal of Developing Areas
Journal of Development Economics
Journal of Development Studies
Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization
Regional Science and Urban Economics
Journal of Economic Issues
Journal of Economics and Business
Journal of Environmental Economics and Management
Journal of Financial Research
Journal of Forecasting
Journal of Health Economics
Journal of International Business Studies
Journal of International Money and Finance
Journal of Labor Research
Journal of Macroeconomics
Journal of Post Keynesian Economics
Journal of Risk and Insurance
Journal of Royal Statistical Society Association A & B
Monthly Labor Review
Population and Development Review
Public Finance Quarterly
Quarterly Review of Economics and Business
Review of Income and Wealth
Review of Social Economy
Science and Society
Scottish Journal of Political Economy
Sloan Management Review
Urban Studies
World Economy
Yale Law Journal

Categories for publication after 7/1/06

FIRST RANKED

American Economic Review
Econometrica
Economic Journal
International Economic Review
Journal of Econometrics
Journal of Economic Literature
Journal of Economic Perspectives
Journal of Economic Theory
Journal of Financial Economics
Journal of Monetary Economics
Journal of Political Economy
Quarterly Journal of Economics
RAND Journal of Economics
Review of Economics and Statistics
Review of Economic Studies

SECOND RANKED

Brookings Papers on Economic
Activity
Canadian Journal of Economics
Econometric Theory
Economic Inquiry
Economic Theory
Economica
Economics Letters
European Economic Review
Games and Economic Behavior
International Journal of
Industrial Organization
Journal of Business and
Economic Statistics
Journal of Development Economics
Journal of Economic Behavior
and Organization
Journal of Economic Dynamics
and Control
Journal of Economic Education
Journal of Economic Growth
Journal of Economic History
Journal of Finance
Journal of Human Resources
Journal of Industrial Economics
Journal of International Economics
Journal of International Money and
Finance
Journal of Labor Economics
Journal of Law and Economics
Journal of Mathematical Economics

Journal of Money, Credit and Banking
Journal of Public Economics
Journal of Urban Economics
Land Economics
Macroeconomic Dynamics
National Tax Journal
NBER Macroeconomics Annual
Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics
Oxford Economic Papers
Public Choice
Review of Economic Dynamics
Review of Financial Studies
Scandinavian Journal of Economics
Social Choice and Welfare
Southern Economic Journal
Weltwirtschaftliches Archiv
THIRD RANKED
American Journal of Agricultural
Economics
Journal of Economics and Business
Journal of Economics and Management
Strategy

American Journal of Economics and Sociology
Applied Economics
British Journal of Industrial Relations
Cambridge Journal of Economics
Cato Journal
Eastern Economic Journal
Economic Development and Cultural Change
Ecological Economics
Economic Geography
Economic History Review
Economic Policy
Economic Record
Economics of Education Review
Environmental and Resource Economics
Explorations in Economic History
Health Economics
History of Political Economy
Industrial and Labor Relations
Review
Industrial Relations
Inquiry
International Journal of
Game Theory
International Monetary Fund
Staff Papers
International Tax and Public
Finance
Journal of Accounting and Economics
Journal of Banking and Finance
Journal of Business
Journal of Comparative Economics
Journal of Development Studies
Journal of Economic Issues
Journal of Economics and Business
Journal of Environmental Economics
and Management
Journal of Financial and Quantitative
Analysis
Journal of Forecasting
Journal of Health Economics
Journal of Japanese and International
Economics
Journal of Labor Research
Journal of Macroeconomics
Journal of Policy Analysis and
Management
Journal of Post Keynesian Economics
Journal of Regional Science
Journal of Risk and Uncertainty

Journal of the American Statistical
Association
Kyklos
Labour Economics
Manchester School
Monthly Labor Review
Oxford Review of Economic Policy
Population and Development Review
Public Finance Quarterly
Quarterly Review of Economics and
Finance
Regional Science and Urban
Economics
Review of Income and Wealth
Review of Industrial Organization
Review of Social Economy
Science and Society
Scottish Journal of Political Economy
World Bank Economic Review
World Development
World Economy